Responsible stakeholders and adaptable fishers

John Mumford
Christine Röckmann
Ellen Hoefnagel

Brussels, Belgium 25 February 2016

The MYFISH Process

Problem Framing Workshops (and Review) - Objectives

- Overview workshop on *MSY variants and constraints*
- Regional workshops on specific *MSY variants*
- Review case studies on *Objective Setting and Implementation*

Management Reflection Workshops - Options

- Regional focus workshops alongside normal fisheries management meetings

Modelled scenarios of option outcomes - Demonstrations

- Specific regional stocks and objectives
- Interviews with fishers and representatives on attitudes and constraints

Feedback on model based results – Evaluation

- Management options compared
- Modelling critique

Overview Workshop

Vigo, Spain 24-25 April 2012

- What to maximize (**MSY variants**)
- What to sustain (**Constraints to sustainability**)
- How to manage fisheries (**Management measures**)
  - Generic list of possible candidates under each topic
  - Regional lists
- 58 participants: 12 universities, 14 fishery research institutes, 8 industry organisations, 3 NGOs and 3 management organisations

MSY Variants Ranked

MSY Variant	Baltic	Mediterranean	North Sea	Western Waters	Widely Ranging	Max	Min	Mean	Range
1 Maximise inclusive governance	-	2	1	3	2	3	1	2.0	2
2 Maximise value of key commercial species	-	5	3	1	-	5	1	3.0	4
3 Maximise Gross Value Added	1	3	9	8	-	9	1	5.3	8
4 Maximise yield in value	6	7	5	2	8	8	2	5.6	6
5 Maximise Net Present Value	7	1	8	7	9	9	1	6.4	8
6 Maximise yield in tonnes of key commercial species	-	5	6	10	-	10	5	7.0	5
7 Minimise risk of falling outside constraints	1	13	-	6	12	13	1	8.0	12
8 Maximise Resource Rent	1	3	19	9	-	19	1	8.0	18
9 Maximise health benefit/CO_2	-	-	-	-	9	9	9	9.0	0
10 Maximise yield in tonnes	9	9	12	13	4	13	4	9.4	9
11 Maximise present yield for human consumption	8	-	-	11	-	11	8	9.5	3
12 Maximise useful knowledge	-	8	13	12	5	13	5	9.5	8
13 Maximise willingness to invest in the future fisheries	12	-	15	4	7	15	4	9.5	11
14 Maximise stability	10	12	7	16	3	16	3	9.6	13
15 Maximise employment on viable fishing units	16	10	-	-	6	16	6	10.7	10
16 Maximise catch in tonnes	11	20	-	-	1	20	1	10.7	19
17 Maximise Social Yield	14	-	14	-	9	14	9	12.3	5
18 Maximise consumer welfare/happiness	5	18	4	18	17	18	4	12.4	14
19 Maximise fisher welfare/happiness	4	17	10	14	18	18	4	12.6	14
20 Maximise number of fishing units	15	19	-	5*	13	19	5	13.0	14
21 Maximise fishing community viability	18	10	16	15	-	18	10	14.8	8
22 Maximise resilience	13	14	17	17	15	17	13	15.2	4
23 Maximise GVA over the entire value chain	17	16	11	18	14	18	11	15.2	7
24 Maximise community biomass	19	15	-	-	16	19	15	16.7	4

Objectives and Implementation

Best practice in three fisheries outside the EU

- Faroe Islands Fisheries
- Australian Northern Prawn Fishery
- Alaska Pollock Fishery

Best practice attributes

- Science
  - Benchmark performance
  - Real-time monitoring
  - Document and communicate rationale and performance
  - Full catch retention
  - Monitor effort creep
- Governance and Rights
  - Accepting policies and management principles essential for compliance
  - Co-management and cost recovery
  - Self-regulation as part of management
  - Fisheries-specific rules
  - Staged control rule steps
  - Durable rights
  - Specific rights for specific social targets

7 Regional Workshops

• Baltic Sea	15 participants
• Mediterranean	
• Eastern (Aegean)	8
• Western (Balearic)	15
• North Sea	23
• Western Waters (Iberian)	13
• Widely Ranging Fish	
• Indian Ocean Tuna	2
• Other Pelagic Fisheries	19

85 persons total

106 Regional Interviews

• Baltic Sea	14 Fishers
• Mediterranean	
• Eastern (Aegean)	2 Representatives
• Western (Balearic)	37 Fishers; 1 Representative
• North Sea	19 Demersal fishers; 14 Round fish
• Western Waters	
• Iberian	1 Representative
• Irish/Celtic Seas	5 Fishers; 2 Representatives
• Widely Ranging Fish	
• Irish Pelagic Fisheries	8 Fishers
• North Sea Herring	3 Representatives

Interview results

- Slight majority of fishers were willing to change due to more or new restrictive management measures to reach MSY
  - Feel they have little choice but to change
- Fishers consider fisheries to have *'top-down management'*
  - Legitimacy and compliance issues can be expected with more restrictive measures
- Fishers want inclusive governance, implying inclusion of different knowledge, information systems and perceptions
- Trust and recognition of different stakes and interests must be more explicitly included in fisheries management

Context for stakeholders

- Baltic: Collapse of stock assessment
- Eastern Med: Greek financial crisis
- North Sea and Western Waters: New CFP, specifically *'landing obligations'*
- Widely Ranging:
  - Mackerel catch opportunities between countries
  - Do not accept *'there is no scientifically determined MSY'*

Conclusions

- Demonstrated sequential inclusive workshop approach
  - Relevant models and visualisation techniques were used in seven fisheries to test attitudes to MSY variants
  - Decision Support Tables were viewed positively, in general, as a starting point for discussion
- Stakeholders expressed views that models did not always address the most pertinent problems, such as:
  - Short term transitions
  - Specific regulations
  - Subsidies and Social costs
  - Good Environmental Status
  - Risk

Conclusions

- Fishers/Stakeholders like flexibility, such as ranges in objectives rather than points; like *'pretty good yield';* like qualitative criteria
  - As part of inclusive governance greater responsibility would be accepted
  - Fishers can express preferences for MSY options, but adapt out of need rather than choice

Thank you for your attention!

Email: j.mumford@imperial.ac.uk
christine.rockmann@wur.nl
ellen.hoefnagel@wur.nl

The research leading to these results has received funding from the European Community's Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007-2013) under grant agreement no 289257 . This publication reflects the views only of the author, and the European Union cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.